

Isaac and Brough (2014) Replication – Study 1

Design:

2 (original vs. debiasing phrasing) x 2 (small vs. large category) between-subjects design
Each participant gave both the probability of drawing Ball #8 and of a gray ball

A. Small Category Size Condition

Balls 1-5 are black, 6-10 are gray, and 11-15 are white.



B. Large Category Size Condition

Balls 1-2 are black, 3-13 are gray, and 14-15 are white.



If one ball is drawn from the urn, what is the probability that it will be ball 8? ____%

Original stimuli.

In the “original” conditions, participants first answered the ball 8 question (as above). In the “debiasing” conditions, participants first answered the probability of a grey ball, and then about the particular grey ball, number 8. These two questions were on separate, consecutive pages.

We were hoping for an interaction effect, showing that the effect goes away only in the debiased/small-category condition. Unfortunately, we found no such effect: $F(1, 511) = .630, p = .428$. Moreover, the original effect failed to replicate: $t(242) = .715, p = .475$, despite trending in the correct direction, as shown below.

